

# Bologna Shoah Memorial Competition



International 2 stage  
on-line contest for the  
Bologna Memorial to  
the Shoah and the  
other victims of Nazism



01.27.2015 01.27.2016

## Bologna Shoah Memorial Competition Jury Report PHASE II

Bologna 29 June 2015  
Boardroom of Bologna's Order of Architects

Today's session opened at 3.30 pm.

Participants:

THE JURY:

- Peter Eisenmann, chairman (via teleconference)
- Rabbi Phelipe Goodmann (via videoconference)
- Maura Pozzati
- Francesco Evangelisti
- Gianfranco Maraniello
- Victor Magiar (via videoconference)
- Simone Cola

Scientific Committee

- Daniele De Paz
- Pier Giorgio Giannelli

Technical Secretariat:

Antonio Gentili - coordinator.

# Bologna Shoah Memorial Competition



International 2 stage  
on-line contest for the  
Bologna Memorial to  
the Shoah and the  
other victims of Nazism



01.27.2015

01.27.2016

Introduction.

The projects selected during the first session on 28 April 2015 were the following:

SHOB1909  
L538146B  
B70LIF339  
B4R67H80

The designers selected had to change their phase I code for the second phase, having indicated it previously on the registration form. The projects received by the Union of Jewish Communities in Rome were all sent by the date established; upon receipt, the Union logged each one with its own protocol number.

Three projects were submitted by the deadline of midday on the 24 June and are opened in the order they were logged.

At 3.50 pm the 1st envelope, B4R67H81 with Protocol no. 3366 of 22.06.2015, is opened; the envelope contains:

1 CD  
1 Report  
1 Itemised estimate  
2 Project Boards

The 2nd envelope, B641835L with Protocol no. 3362 of 22.06.2015, is then opened; the envelope contains:

1 CD  
1 File with Report - Itemised estimate  
2 Project Boards

# Bologna Shoah Memorial Competition



International 2 stage  
on-line contest for the  
Bologna Memorial to  
the Shoah and the  
other victims of Nazism



01.27.2015 01.27.2016

The 3rd envelope, 9B37F0IL with Protocol no. 3356 of 22.06.2015, is opened;  
the envelope contains:

- 1 CD
- 1 File with Report - Itemised estimate
- 2 Project Boards

However, one of the envelopes corresponding to one of the four projects  
chosen, that of the first acronym, SHOB1909, was not received.

The jury begins by assessing project **9B37FOIL** which has the lowest Protocol  
number, 3356, as it was clearly the first to be submitted;

- The feasibility of the project is discussed, as well as any interference that  
may arise with the wind, given its height of 10 m, which is comparable to  
a 3 storey building;
- The foundations are discussed;
- The shingle paving is assessed and the Itemised Estimate is analysed.  
The weight of the structure is considered and the possibility of being able  
to pass between the two walls is commented on.

The jury goes on to evaluate project **B4R67H81** which has Protocol no. 3366:

- The fact that the wall blocks access to the rear of the structure is  
underlined and the colour of the actual wall, black, is discussed to assess  
whether it allows the intrinsic message of the Competition's theme to be  
perceived correctly;
- The Itemised Estimate is assessed as being feasible and credible due to  
the simplicity of construction.

# Bologna Shoah Memorial Competition



International 2 stage  
on-line contest for the  
Bologna Memorial to  
the Shoah and the  
other victims of Nazism



01.27.2015

01.27.2016

At 4.45 pm the jury goes on to open the third envelope, **B641835L** with protocol no. 3362;

- Victor Magiar points out the issue of the view of the railway as this does not correspond to the drawings since the user will never have the opportunity to view the structure from the water;
- A problem of maintenance regarding the body of water is underlined;
- Once again the discussion turns to general assessment and the legitimacy of costs in particular.

The jury discusses the projects in general; the choice of the “black wall” project to isolate the rear part is discussed and assessment is made as to how and when it would be possible to talk to the designer to learn more about this issue.

At 5.30 pm a link is established with Rabbi Felipe Goodman.

The chairman of the Jury, Mr. Eisemann, sets out the rules for the vote and an anonymous form of voting is agreed.

Chairman Eisemann is asked to give a general evaluation but declines as he does not wish to influence the vote in any way.

Anonymous voting then begins with each vote being cast using a special card; Eisemann and Goodmann send their preferences by text message to the private number of the Chairman of the Scientific Committee Mr. De Paz, to protect their confidentiality.

At 5.50 pm the results are read out and the winner is declared - project **9B37FOIL**.

The jury expresses its satisfaction with the professionalism and the participation with which all the competitors addressed the theme proposed in the competition announcement.

The projects selected during the first phase are all excellent designs and are characterised by sobriety, without giving way to kitsch or sensationalism. On the

# Bologna Shoah Memorial Competition



International 2 stage  
on-line contest for the  
Bologna Memorial to  
the Shoah and the  
other victims of Nazism



01.27.2015

01.27.2016

basis of this, the Jury was able to arrive at a substantial unit of evaluation on the three projects submitted.

The competition's winning entry, with 5 points out of 7, is code **9B37FOIL**. It is a strong project that cleverly interprets its placement in the urban context. It is a three-dimensional structure that is clearly visible from the surrounding road and the railway. An iconographic starting point that recalls the memory of the Shoah is transformed into a dramatic and universal space. The object offers itself to dialogue with passers-by/visitors by creating new public areas, intended for different uses (passing-by, stopping and meditation).

In further developing the project, the Jury recommend that particular attention be paid to the aspects regarding safety and economic compatibility with the limits established in the competition announcement.

Second place was awarded, with 2 points out of 7, to project code **B4R67H81**; a project characterised by great clarity from a point of view of urban insertion, which however, compared to the previous project, excludes use by the public of a significant part of the area covered by the competition, with the result of creating a smaller public space that is more limited to immediate use, as it can only be viewed from the road. Furthermore, from a point of view of representing the meaning, the project is less explicit than the previous and thus more difficult to recognise as being linked to the specific memory that we wish to honour here.

Third place is awarded to project code **B641835L**; although this is a striking solution, which invites passers-by to stop and meditate, in the first phase the project does not develop the issue of feasibility, especially as regards management procedures; furthermore, like the previous entry, it significantly reduces the public space and does not appear to convincingly address the issue of how it would be visible from the station.

The Jury also awards a Special Mention to project code **SHOB1909** which was invited to participate in the second phase but was not submitted. In actual fact,

# Bologna Shoah Memorial Competition



International 2 stage  
on-line contest for the  
Bologna Memorial to  
the Shoah and the  
other victims of Nazism



01.27.2015

01.27.2016

this project, in the representation presented in the first phase is characterised by a design quality based on elements of simplicity, effectiveness and recognisability which led the jury to believe that there would be significant opportunity for development in the second phase. Therefore this project is considered worthy of a Special Mention.

Now the file containing the credentials to match the names to the project codes, which the Union of Italian Jewish Communities sent to the Secretariat of the Order, is opened.

Therefore, the classification, obtained by matching the names to the codes, is as follows:

1. Onorato di Manno, Andrea Tanci, Gianluca Sist, Lorenzo Catena, Chiara Cucina - Italy
2. Stefano Lambardi, Stella Venturini, Giulia Cerretani, Simone Barbi, Fabiagio Salerno, Nicola Bondi, Fabio Montefusco - Italy
3. Devvy Comacchio, Paolo Didonè - Italy

In order to be able to close the Competition definitively, the Coordinating Secretariat will ensure that the winning group meets the general requirements and that there are no impediments, under article 38 of Legislative Decree 163/2006 and subsequent amendments, as declared upon submission of the project.

Work ends at 7.30 pm.